

Duval County Public Schools

April 27, 2009, Special Board Meeting

Ms. Betty Burney

Mr. Tommy Hazouri, Chairman

Mr. Stan Jordan

Mr. W. C. Gentry

Ms. Nancy Broner

Ms. Vicki Drake

Ms. Brenda Priestly Jackson, Vice Chairman

Mr. Ed Pratt-Dannals, Superintendent

ATTENDANCE AT THIS SPECIAL MEETING OF THE DUVAL COUNTY SCHOOL BOARD with Mr. Ed Pratt-Dannals, Superintendent of Schools, Ms. Karen Chastain, Office of General Counsel, Ms. Cindy Laquidara, Chief Deputy General Counsel, Mr. Tommy Hazouri, Board Chairman, Ms. Brenda Priestly Jackson, Vice Chairman and Board members: Ms. Nancy Broner, Ms. Betty Burney, Ms. Vicki Drake, Mr. W. C. Gentry and Mr. Stan Jordan, present.

Call Meeting to Order

CALL MEETING TO ORDER

Minutes: The Chairman called the meeting to order at 5:03 p.m.

Invocation

Pledge of Allegiance

Presentations

Comments From Audience

COMMENTS FROM AUDIENCE

Minutes:

Mr. James Gilman, a concerned citizen in the district, said we're facing a crisis at this time. I believe we're better off today because we had the opportunity to receive a full education and not 7/8 of an education. By reducing education opportunities for our future leaders, I see the following consequences: Students are more apt to be disadvantaged when seeking higher education and job opportunities; parents will incur higher costs to ensure their children will stay out of trouble and receive the necessary education; police will have an increased burden; employers will encounter reduced productivity from its workforce; there most likely will be "brain drain" - people with high incomes with advanced degrees are more likely to value education. If this workforce leaves and we're not filling the gap with an educated workforce, businesses will leave the state. If jobs leave the state, tax revenues go down and property values go down. Everyone can point out the challenges and I want to help. I know there has been some talk about funding the gap with a tax. I propose with large community stakeholders to raise the necessary funds through donations. Through sales and marketing, people and businesses will willingly make the necessary monetary donations to ensure: our children will be better prepared to compete in a global economy; that Jacksonville would be better able to keep its jobs and attract new jobs that are high valued and not offer commodity wages; lower crime and enjoy prosperity. I'm confident we could line up highly effective and skilled lawyers to fight our case, pro bono. Let's work together and I recommend a Board member to make a motion to form a special committee to investigate finding additional sources of money.

Mr. Dennis Maple, president for Aramark Education, and I thank the Board and Superintendent and the community for the opportunity to present to you this evening. We've been here for 19 years serving as your partner for food services but I don't think that would be appropriate. We have three things we want to present: (1) Talk about our 19 year partnership; (2) Why we believe Aramark is the best choice to continue to serve this district; and (3) To talk about our recommendations on how we can move forward. Our priority has always been to provide nutritious and good meals for the students in this district and we believe we've done this. When we came here in 1989, there was a \$2.8 million dollar deficit and as of 2006, there was somewhere in the neighborhood of \$18.6 million dollars in the Food Service fund. What this enabled the district to do was to build this new Nutrition & Facilities Services location that you have today. We think it's important to know that the current year we're in that we have projected a \$500,000 surplus for this year and I want to make sure we're clear about that. We think during our tenure, we've increased customer service and training in food quality, we've increased compliance with nutrition and regulatory standards, and we've recently passed both the Commodities Audit and the CRE Audit. We've assisted with the implementation of the district's state of the art Centralized Food Production Facility. I think what's really critical about this is to recognize that Aramark Education is the only one of the three providers that has a significant amount of experience in the nutrition center that you have. The largest is 220,000 square feet in Houston which is about to release a piece on ABC World News Tonight on the success of that facility. Duval is the second largest facility having 68,000 square feet. Again, we've committed ourselves to this community and have participated with everything from Habitat for Humanities, Second Harvest Food Bank and the like. The bottom line is we believe

we're the best recommendation for this district. These are very difficult economic times and as we've said in the communication to you, we are the only proposer that has given a guarantee of \$1.3 million dollars annually to this fund. That is an unlimited guarantee. If the food program were to not make money, it would be on us to make up the difference and also, I'd point out that our cost to the district is .14 cents per meal less than the proposer that seems to be recommended by the administration. So, again, we're asking for your support and we have 828 employees that we would like to continue to employ in this district and we're not certain what would happen to them in the event that you make a different choice. Thank you very much.

Mr. Timothy Conner, a partner with Holland & Knight, representing Aramark Education and I attended the workshop on 4/21/09. What is clear to me is one of the concerns of several members of this Board is that the process in awarding the contract here was defective in a number of different ways. The result has been that the Constitutional requirement that this Board exercises is discretion in awarding a contract of this size has been undermined. Essentially, the Board has been told "this is a done deal; here is our recommendation; you need to accept it". No discretion to be exercised by the Board whatsoever. The recommendation of the Superintendent in this case, frankly, is not what is in the best interest of the school district. In these economic times in particular, the contract that is recommended by the district staff will cost the district \$10-\$15 million dollars more than the proposed contract by Aramark over the life of the contract. Now, what can the Board do about that? Are there any options that the Board has to exercise its discretion and the answer is "yes". Option one - the Board can extend the current contract with Aramark for one year and during that time period, go back out to bid with a process that it approves in the exercise of its discretion. Now, we have spoken today to USDA. There are communications that have occurred where it has been presented to USDA by someone with staff, we don't know who, that this is a done deal and USDA's reaction to that was, "Well, if it's a done deal, the Board has acted appropriately." That is not accurate and this is not a done deal until this Board acts and USDA has specifically advised us that if what we're telling them is accurate, they would reconsider, they would look at everything that we would provide and they would issue a decision but that they need 24 hours. A second option is to award the contract under consideration to Aramark for one year and go back out to rebid, again. A third option is to reject all bids, send it back out for rebid immediately and we would urge you when you vote this evening, to reject the recommendation of the staff and proceed on one of those three options.

Ms. Roddie Williams, a cafeteria manager and I'm here with concerns. I've worked for eight years as cafeteria manager at a job that I enjoy. It's one thing if you're going to have another company but to be in the dark, our loss is to where we fit in? What happens to us? There are concerns as to whether you still have a job and will you still have the same rate of pay? Will we lose some of that? What about the time that put in...I enjoy what I do and I love children and these are things we really need to know. I don't know if they'll be answered here but I thought I'd come forth and say this is what my heart is all about because, frankly speaking, I'm too old to be looking for another job. I mean, that's just being honest. That's it for me. Thank you very much.

Dr. Jonathan Evans, co-chair of the Childhood Obesity Prevention Coalition and also a member of the SHAC (Student Health Advisory Council) and District Wellness Committee. I also wanted to add my two cents or actually budget neutral cents on the

Food Service contract issue. To date, there's been no formal review by or there's been no knowledgeable and critical review of the proposed menus and nutritional quality of the menus that have been as part of the formal process of the review. We were able to review and this is to... Certified Pediatric Dietitians were able actually review the proposed menus by the three vendors over the course of this past weekend and they have found that there are some significant issues and areas for improvement both practical and conceptual in terms of the way that we will be feeding our children. We ask that once this issue is resolved that there be ongoing talks and discussions to further improve the diets and meals we're serving our children. This is not an issue just about money, but about health. In closing, actually I would mention that obesity is a disease that is already costing our society significantly. It's costing the school system significantly, but especially it's costing our children both in terms of their well-being and in terms of their physical health. We would ask that the meals that we serve our children be part of the solution. Thank you.

Speaker:

Ms. Betty Burney, Board Member

Mr. Warren Thompson and I stand tonight to represent the partnership between Chartwell's and Thompson Hospitality. Chartwell's is a division of Compass Group so I also serve on the Board of Compass Group and I'm speaking for that entity, as well. Thompson Hospitality, the partner in this group, is my company. There are three things I'd like to make sure we get across tonight. (1) This group is experienced and ready to serve the students here. (2) I want to touch on the deal; and (3) What I'd like this Board to act upon. First and foremost, we have the experience to do an excellent job. We've run Chicago Public Schools for seven years. We've run Newark Public Schools, St. Louis Public Schools, and most recently, the District of Columbia. We started out in Chicago operating half the school district and subsequently, picked up the entire school district on the second phase of that bid. The experience between Chartwell's and Thompson coming in and operating has been tremendous. Our employees and our associates embrace what it is we do in terms of training and development. Our employees would not have to come to you tonight and ask, "What's going to happen to us?" because they know who they're going to deal with and they've dealt with us for ten years. Keith, who is going to come up after me, has been my partner in this endeavor for ten years. Let me just touch on the deal that's been put forth. You've heard alot of numbers going back and forth, some as recent as a few minutes ago indicating that \$10-\$15 million dollar difference. That is clearly not the case. The deal that we put forth to the Board is one that will get the district to...a guaranteed brea-even, first and foremost. Secondly, a \$1 million dollar guaranteed return coming off the commissary, paid back to the school district. The objective of the RFP was to balance, not only cost, but to also look at quality. I'd like to spend more time talking about the importance of quality because at the end of the day, we're here for the students and we can't lose sight of the fact that unless you serve a quality product, the students are not going to want to eat it. Now, I can give you low ball price and give you inferior quality, but that's going to be exactly what you've had for the last 19 years. If you want to move the district forward, you have to balance quality, you have to balance cost and the third component is investment. Now, we put forth a \$4.8 million dollar investment with absolutely no interest charged back to the school district. We did not put some small print in and say, "Look, we'll charge back

interest to the General Fund." We've put in \$4 million dollars of investment to support the quality program that we're offering. What I'd like this Board to do is to move forward with the recommendation to allow the administration to negotiate the best contract for the school district with significant oversight of this Board. We want you to be involved. We want to get your support and we want this to be a true partnership. Thank you.

Mr. Keith Cullinan, president of Chartwell's, and I just want to echo some of the things that Warren said. We feel as though the process was fair and equitable. It was approved by the USDA. It was approved by the Florida Department of Education and we followed that process and I think that you have to operate with integrity and ethics and we believe we've done that and we think our proposal is the best proposal for the students of Duval County. We've heard an awful lot of talk about price and capital, but what's best for the kids? We believe that our program from a food quality, from a food safety and a nutrition standpoint, is what is best for the students of Duval County. Thank you very much.

Mr. Anthony Ammons, Henry Roberts School Company, and we've had the opportunity to do business with Aramark over the years, probably close to ten years. Although most of our business is on the retail side with some of the local super markets, etc., much of our business is under Food Service recently with Aramark. They've been a good company to do business with. We are locally owned and we offer bar-b-que sauce and some other products to the School Board through Aramark. They are a vital part of our business. I just wanted to come here and make sure my voice is heard and to ensure that Aramark's voice is heard, as well.

Ms. Patricia Ann Johnson, Food Service Manager for Duval County School Board for 30 years. I recently retired July 1, 2008 and am currently re-employed with Aramark Services and I would like to say a few words. I've been employed with Aramark since they took over, our contract. I can truly say it's been a family oriented environment for me to work for them. I would like to ask the Board to reconsider Aramark Services as our management company for the 2009-2010 school year. Thank you.

Mr. Anthony Zebouni, representing Sodexo, and over 20 years, I've seen you make alot of difficult decisions and I know we have Ms. Laquidara and Ms. Chastain that are here with you today. I made my presentation before the protest Hearing Officer and that decision was rendered. I'm here to say that I'm here tonight in the event, representing Sodexo, I can answer any questions to assist you in arriving at a fair response to this difficult situation. I want to thank you very much in the event you find in your heart to find a way this year, two years, five years to ever retain Sodexo to provide services. I'm advised not only will they have staff on board, but they'd be retaining me, too, so if you ever have a problem in the future, Sodexo will always have someone that will be available to the Duval County School District to provide services and to let you know that you have a wonderful partner and I'll be here to answer any questions if you have any that you'd like to ask me.

Ms. Lorna Donatone, president of Sodexo School Services. I'm pleased to be here tonight. My team and I know that Sodexo is the leading provider of services to K-12 public education world-wide, but I'm here tonight, not as a vendor, not as a potential contract; I'm here as a partner. I believe that if you have a strong partner committed

to creating change, committed to innovation and financial success, that you're going to create successful student nutrition program. Your cook/chill operation here is a complexed and sophisticated operation. We understand that and we operate similar facilities in a number of school settings across the United States. This gives Sodexo the unique experience that you should demand in any provider. Nutrition is important to you, our students and our plan has new menus, new serving concept and more healthy choices for your students than they experience today. Our offer also brings over \$2 million dollars to the local community and minority business participation...not just minority participation, but local minority business participation. So, Sodexo "walks the talk" around diversity inclusion. It's a way of life for us; it's not just a program. This way of life has been validated with our #6 ranking on Diversity, Inc.'s top 50 companies in the country for 2009. Our offer creates a "win win" in that our forecast for meals serve/cost and financial return are realistic. I absolutely require our teams to turn in realistic financials when bidding. We must be able to live up to our word. Sodexo requires it and I require it. Sodexo works hard and enjoys the reputation for passing state audits, for living up to our commitments without excuses, and truly being a partner for the school districts that we serve. We, at Sodexo, believe that the merits of our offer and the reputation of our firm speaks for themselves. We have studied your district for months with a dedicated, on-site, local team who will live here and own this success. You have options here. If you do decide to rebid this program, we will be ready to respond immediately and we look forward to serving Duval County. Thank you.

Ms. Christine Guajardo, chaired the Health and Safety Committee for the Duval County Council of PTA. I served on the RFP Selection Committee. I spent countless hours reviewing over probably 1,700+ pages of documents, thoroughly analyzing everything in there, comparing it to what was part of the RFP packet that was given to us that was part of the committee. I'm here today to assure that we did a thorough examination of all the companies. We looked at all of them fairly. We looked at the same criteria for each of them, independently. We did not compare one to the other. We judged each of them on their own merit and I'm greatly concerned that the Board has not voted in favor of the recommended provider. All of the people on the committee worked very hard to ensure that what was best for our district and for our children and, I have two children in public schools, was done and on behalf of the administration. So, I wanted to tell you I personally like the staff of the current provider. I appreciate all of their contributions to the community and also for our schools. I have a child with food allergies and they have gone above and beyond for my child this year. So, I appreciate all of that, but it's not about those things. It's about the information that was provided and what is best in the interest of our children and the district. So, I would just like to encourage you to please accept what the committee did. Please accept our hard work in reviewing that. One of the companies left information off of the disk that were given to the committee members, so we reconvened and allowed that information to be accepted because it was included in their original RFP. So, it was fair; that information was judged and they were given the credit for having that information included. So, I just would like to encourage you to please reconsider and accept our committee recommendation. Thank you very much.

Mr. Bingham Parkinson said I am a concerned citizen of Duval County with children who have gone through the public school system and my main concern is at this

current time with high unemployment and high costs of School Board operations and the high cost of education, I think that what we need to do is to consider the lowest option that we have. The lowest price option that we currently have. It's a guaranteed price. We know the service and the product that we received over the last 18 years and in addition to that, we would be saving an additional...not additional, we'd be saving 800+ jobs. So, I encourage you to think about what's best for the community and what's best for our residents in maintaining their jobs. Thank you very much.

Comments From Parent Organizations

Comments From Employee Organizations

Student Achievement, Reform Activities, And Reports

Reports

Approval of Agenda

APPROVAL OF THE APRIL 27, 2009, AGENDA

Motions:	
That the Duval County School Board approve the April 27 2009, Agenda as submitted on April 24, 2009.	- PASS
Vote Results	
Motion: William Gentry	
Second: Victoria Drake	
Nancy Broner	- Aye
Betty Burney	- Aye
Victoria Drake	- Aye
William Gentry	- Aye
Thomas Hazouri	- Aye
Stan Jordan	- Aye
Brenda Priestly jackson	- Aye

Approval of Minutes

Approval of Consent Agenda

Consent Agenda

Discussion

Operations - Purchasing and Logistics

1. FOOD SERVICE DEPARTMENT MANAGEMENT AND OPERATION

Attachment: XX-REV-031709COMPANY-COMPARISON-BD-COPY2.XLS.pdf

Attachment: FOOD SERVICE COST EVALUATION POINTS.pdf

Attachment: FOOD SERVICES EVALUATION FINAL.pdf

Minutes:

Speakers:

Ms. Betty Burney, Board Member

Mr. Ed Pratt-Dannals, Superintendent of Schools

Mr. Tommy Hazouri, Board Chairman

Ms. Brenda Priestly Jackson, Vice Chairman

Mr. Stan Jordan, Board Member

Mr. W. C. Gentry, Board Member

Ms. Karen Chastain, Office of General Counsel

Ms. Cindy Laquidara, Chief Deputy General Counsel

Ms. Nancy Broner, Board Member

Mr. Jordan said, "Ms. Laquidara, this Board is assuming but rather than imply, let me specify that any request made for transitional consideration to this Board to extend the existing contract would be done without prejudice...without any penalty toward this Board. Is that correct?"

Ms. Laquidara responded, "Well, certainly yes...one of the conditions would be to ask USDA, and this would all have to come back to you, but to ask them what conditions. There may be certain contractual provisions that need to be modified and changed. I really don't know but you would certainly ask on what conditions that they had, if any."

Mr. Jordan offered a motion to postpone this item to a time certain, Monday, May 4, 2009, at 2:00 o'clock, for the purpose of dealing with the Food Service contract.

Ms. Drake seconded the motion to defer the item.

Mr. Gentry said, "I don't know if we need an amendment but I move to amend the motion to be consistent with that decision that by tomorrow afternoon (April 28, 2009), no later than tomorrow, that Mr. Hazouri or

staff draft a letter from Mr. Hazouri that clearly and succinctly lays out the question that we need to have answered and include a copy of the Aramark contract with it, so the DOE and the federal government can see what we're dealing with...transmitted immediately, email it and request an immediate response."

Mr. Jordan stated, "My motion includes that language; that's an implied reference."

Speakers:

Mr. Tommy Hazouri, Board Chairman

Ms. Cindy Laquidara, Chief Deputy General Counsel

Mr. Jordan said the motion is to "postpone definitely to Monday, May 4, 2009 (time certain) at 2:00 o'clock for the purpose of receiving information and disposing of the award including the language above stated by Board Member Gentry."

Speakers:

Ms. Brenda Priestly Jackson, Vice Chairman

Ms. Cindy Laquidara, Chief Deputy General Counsel

Mr. Stan Jordan, Board Member

Mr. W. C. Gentry, Board Member

Mr. Ed Pratt-Dannals, Superintendent of Schools

Mr. Doug Ayars, Chief of Operations

Ms. Nancy Broner, Board Member

Mr. Larry Ganger, Supervisor, Purchasing Services

Motions:

That the Duval County School Board award the Food Service Department Management and Operations contract to Compass Group USA, Inc., by and through its Chartwell's Division, and authorize the Superintendent and the Board Chairman to execute the contract upon completion of negotiations and form approval of the contract by the Office of General Counsel.

Vote Results

Motion: Nancy Broner Second: Victoria Drake Motions:

Postpone Item - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Stan Jordan Second: Victoria Drake

Nancy Broner - Aye
Betty Burney - Aye
Victoria Drake - Aye
William Gentry - Aye
Thomas Hazouri - Nay
Stan Jordan - Aye
Brenda Priestly jackson - Aye

Academic Services - School Curriculum and Programs

1. HIGH SCHOOL AND MIDDLE SCHOOL SCHEDULING CONFIGURATION FOR 2009-2010

Attachment: <u>H S BENEFITS AND CHALLENGES 4-27-09.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>M S BENEFITS AND CHALLENGES 4-27-09.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>HS MS Schedule Recommendations 4-27-09.pdf</u>

Minutes:

Speakers:

Ms. Betty Burney, Board Member

Mr. Stan Jordan, Board Member

Mr. Ed Pratt-Dannals, Superintendent of Schools

Ms. Nancy Broner, Board Member

Ms. Patricia Willis, Deputy Superintendent

Ms. Brenda Priestly Jackson, Vice Chairman

Mr. W. C. Gentry, Board Member

Mr. Tommy Hazouri, Board Chairman

Motions:

1. That the Duval County School Board approve

the seven-period hybrid schedule for all high schools with the exception of Douglas Anderson School of the Arts, Frank H. Peterson Academies of Technology, and A. Philip Randolph Academies of Technology and approve the continuation of the eight-period A/B block schedule for these three schools. 2. That the Duval County School Board approve the sevenperiod hybrid schedule for the seven middle schools presently on the block schedule, approve the option of a straight 7-period schedule or a 7-period hybrid schedule for all other middle schools presently on the straight 6period schedule and approve LaVilla School of the Arts to be excluded from these schedule configurations and remain on its current block schedule.

- PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Nancy Broner Second: Victoria Drake

Victoria Drake - Aye
William Gentry - Aye
Thomas Hazouri - Aye
Stan Jordan - Aye
Brenda Priestly jackson - Nay
Nancy Broner - Aye
Betty Burney - Nay

2. PUBLIC HEARING AND VOTE ON MODIFICATIONS TO THE 2008-2009 STUDENT PROGRESSION PLAN

Attachment: <u>High School Graduation Requirements.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>SPP BENEFITS AND CHALLENGES 4-27-09.pdf</u>

Attachment: World Language Waiver 4 27 09.pdf

Minutes:

The Chairman declared the public hearing open on the following item:

Modifications to the 2008-2009 Student Progression Plan

The Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to speak to the Board

regarding this item; there being no response, the Chairman closed the public hearing.

Speakers:

Ms. Brenda Priestly Jackson, Vice Chairman

Ms. Nancy Broner, Board Member

Mr. W. C. Gentry, Board Member

Mr. Ed Pratt-Dannals, Superintendent of Schools

Mr. Tommy Hazouri, Board Chairman

Motions:

That the Duval County School Board approve changes to the 2008-2009 Student Progression Plan related to the course and credit graduation requirements to align with the graduation requirements outlined in Florida Statute 1003.428.

- PASS

Vote Results

Motion: William Gentry Second: Victoria Drake

Nancy Broner - Aye
Betty Burney - Nay
Victoria Drake - Aye
William Gentry - Aye
Thomas Hazouri - Aye
Stan Jordan - Aye
Brenda Priestly jackson - Nay

Board Member Travel

Superintendent's Travel

For The Record

Adjournment

ADJOURNMENT

	Minutes:		
	The Special meeting adjourned at 8:28 p.m.		
	Isd		
Superint	endent	Chairman	